VIRGINIA FAIR HOUSING BOARD

MINUTES OF MEETING

September 27, 2012

The Fair Housing Board Meeting was held at the Department of Professional and Occupational Regulation, 9960 Mayland Drive, Richmond, Virginia. The following Board members were present:

Phyllis Randall, Chair Matthew K. Kim Thomas Gifford Jim Ginnell Andrew Reisinger Jeffrey Adkins Bob Boynton

The following Board members were absent:

F. Thomas Eck, IV, Vice-Chair

David Rubinstein Rosemary Wilson Linda Broady-Myers Francis Stevens

DPOR Staff present for all or part of the meeting included:

Gordon Dixon, Director
Christine Martine, Executive Director
Mark Courtney, Senior Director
Liz Hayes, Fair Housing Administrator
Deanda Shelton, Assistant Fair Housing Administrator
Emily Trent, Administrative Assistant
Angela Keefe-Thomas, Fair Housing Investigator
Matthew Benson, Fair Housing Investigator

Tom Payne, Assistant Attorney General with the Office of the Attorney General, was present.

Ms. Randall called the meeting to order at 10:05 A.M.

Call to Order

A motion was made by Mr. Boynton and seconded by Mr. Agenda
Ginnell to approve the Agenda. The motion passed
unanimously. Members voting "Yes" were: Adkins,
Boynton, Gifford, Ginnell, Kim, Randall and Reisinger.

A motion was made by Mr. Gifford and seconded by Mr. Ginnell to approve the June 14, 2012, Fair Housing Board Meeting minutes. The motion passed unanimously. Members voting "Yes" were: Adkins, Boynton, Gifford, Ginnell, Kim, Randall and Reisinger.

Minutes

There was no public comment.

Liz Hayes updated the Board on the current investigative case load.

In the matter of FHB File Number 2012-03109, Maude Turner v. City of Virginia Beach, the Board reviewed the record which consisted of the Final Investigative Report and Case Analysis and Recommendation. Maude Turner, complainant, and Kay Wilson, attorney for the respondent, were present and addressed the Board. A motion was made by Mr. Gifford and seconded by Mr. Ginnell to close the case with a finding of no reasonable cause. The motion passed unanimously. Members voting "Yes" were: Adkins, Boynton, Gifford, Ginnell, Kim, Randall and Reisinger.

FHB File Number 2010-01881, Terra Bacon v. Terrace Properties, LLC, Shanel Corporation, and Vince Ferranti

In the matter of FHB File Number 2010-01881, Terra Bacon v. Terrace Properties, LLC, Shanel Corporation, and Vince Ferranti, the Board reviewed the record which consisted of the Final Investigative Report and Case Analysis and Recommendation, and Official Consultation Memorandum from the Office of the Attorney General. Lawrence Bacon, witness, Neil Kuchinski, attorney for the respondents, and Vince Ferranti, respondent, were present and addressed the Board.

At 10:59 A.M., Mr. Adkins offered a motion which was seconded by Mr. Boynton, that the Board meeting be recessed and that the Fair Housing Board immediately reconvene in closed meeting for the purpose of consultation with legal counsel and briefings by staff members pertaining to actual or probable litigation as permitted by §2.2-3711.A.7 of the *Code of Virginia*. The following nonmembers will be in attendance to reasonably aid the consideration of the topic: Tom Payne, Deanda Shelton and Liz Hayes.

This motion is made with respect to the matter(s) identified

Public Comment

<u>Fair Housing</u> Administrator's Report

FHB File Number 2012-03109, Maude Turner v. City of Virginia Beach

Closed Session

as agenda item(s):

8. FHB File Number 2010-01881, Terra Bacon v. Terrace Properties, LLC, Shanel Corporation, and Vince Ferranti

At 11:45 A.M., a motion was made by Mr. Adkins and seconded by Mr. Boynton that the Board reconvene in open session.

WHEREAS, the Fair Housing Board has convened a closed meeting on this date pursuant to an affirmative recorded vote in accordance with the provisions of the Virginia Freedom of Information Act; and

WHEREAS, §2.2-3712 of the *Code of Virginia* requires a certification by this Fair Housing Board that such closed meeting was conducted in conformity with Virginia law;

NOW, THEREFORE, BE IT RESOLVED that the Fair Housing Board hereby certifies that, to the best of each member's knowledge, (i) only public business matters lawfully exempted from open meeting requirements by Virginia law were discussed in the closed meeting to which this certification resolution applies and (ii) only such public business matters as were identified in the motion convening the closed meeting were heard, discussed or considered by the Fair Housing Board.

VOTE: 7-0

AYES: Adkins, Boynton, Gifford, Ginnell, Kim, Randall and Reisinger.

NAYS: None.

ABSENT DURING THE VOTE: None.

ABSENT DURING THE MEETING: Broady-Myers, Eck, Rubinstein, Stevens and Wilson.

In the matter of FHB File Number 2010-01881, Terra Bacon v. Terrace Properties, LLC, Shanel Corporation, and Vince Ferranti, a motion was made by Mr. Adkins and seconded by Ms. Randall to find reasonable cause the

Certification

FHB File Number 2010-01881, Terra Bacon v. Terrace Properties, LLC, Shanel Corporation, and

respondents discriminated against the complainant for Vince Ferranti refusal to rent based upon familial status. The motion failed. Members voting "Yes" were: Adkins, Ginnell, and Randall. Members voting "No" were: Boynton, Gifford, Kim and Reisinger.

A motion was made by Mr. Ginnell and seconded by Mr. Kim to find reasonable cause the respondents discriminated against the complainant by imposing discriminatory terms and conditions based upon familial status. The motion passed by majority vote. Members voting "Yes" were Adkins, Boynton, Kim, Ginnell and Randall. Members voting "No" were Gifford and Reisinger.

A motion was made by Mr. Reisinger and seconded by Mr. Gifford to find no reasonable cause the respondent discriminated against the complainant by refusing to rent based upon familial status. The motion passed by majority vote. Members voting "Yes" were Boynton, Gifford, Kim and Reisinger. Members voting "No" were Adkins, Ginnell and Randall.

The Board recessed from 12:12 P.M. to 12:20 P.M.

In the matter of FHB File Number 2010-00882, Jody Nescola v. Samuel and Gail Long, the Board reviewed the record which consisted of the Final Investigative Report and Case Analysis and Recommendation, and Official Consultation Memorandum from the Office of the Attorney Samuel Long, respondent, was present and General. addressed the Board.

At 12:20 P.M., Ms. Randall offered a motion which was Closed Session seconded by Mr. Reisinger, that the Board meeting be recessed and that the Fair Housing Board immediately reconvene in closed meeting for the purpose of consultation with legal counsel and briefings by staff members pertaining to actual or probable litigation as permitted by §2.2-3711.A.7 of the Code of Virginia. The following nonmembers will be in attendance to reasonably aid the consideration of the topic: Tom Payne and Liz Hayes.

This motion is made with respect to the matter(s) identified as agenda item(s):

Break

FHB File Number 2010-00882, Jody Nescola v. Samuel and Gail Long

9. FHB File Number 2010-00882, Jody Nescola v. Samuel and Gail Long

At 12:35 P.M., a motion was made by Ms. Randall and seconded by Mr. Reisinger that the Board reconvene in open session.

WHEREAS, the Fair Housing Board has convened a closed meeting on this date pursuant to an affirmative recorded vote in accordance with the provisions of the Virginia Freedom of Information Act; and

WHEREAS, §2.2-3712 of the *Code of Virginia* requires a certification by this Fair Housing Board that such closed meeting was conducted in conformity with Virginia law;

NOW, THEREFORE, BE IT RESOLVED that the Fair Housing Board hereby certifies that, to the best of each member's knowledge, (i) only public business matters lawfully exempted from open meeting requirements by Virginia law were discussed in the closed meeting to which this certification resolution applies and (ii) only such public business matters as were identified in the motion convening the closed meeting were heard, discussed or considered by the Fair Housing Board.

VOTE: 7-0

AYES: Adkins, Boynton, Gifford, Ginnell, Kim, Randall and Reisinger.

NAYS: None.

ABSENT DURING THE VOTE: None.

ABSENT DURING THE MEETING: Broady-Myers, Eck, Rubinstein, Stevens and Wilson.

In the matter of FHB File Number 2010-00882, Jody Nescola v. Samuel and Gail Long, a motion was made by Ms. Randall and seconded by Mr. Gifford to find no reasonable cause the respondents discriminated against the complainant by making discriminatory statements based on familial status. The motion passed unanimously. Members voting "Yes" were: Adkins, Boynton, Gifford, Ginnell,

Certification

FHB File Number 2010-00882, Jody Nescola v. Samuel and Gail Long

Kim, Randall and Reisinger.

A motion was made by Ms. Randall and seconded by Mr. Ginnell to find no reasonable cause the respondents discriminated against the complainant by refusing to rent or negotiate based on familial status. The motion passed unanimously. Members voting "Yes" were: Adkins, Boynton, Gifford, Ginnell, Kim, Randall and Reisinger.

In the matter of FHB File Number 2011-04838, Pamela Edwards and Joshua Jones v. Patrice Freeman, Cliff Testerman, Virginia Housing Development Authority and Rooftop of Virginia Community Action Program, the Board reviewed the record which consisted of the Final Investigative Report and Case Analysis Recommendation, and Official Consultation Memorandum from the Office of the Attorney General. Pamela Edwards, complainant, addressed the Board via telephone. Godfrey Pinn, attorney for the respondents, was present and addressed the Board.

FHB File Number 2011-04838, Pamela Edwards and Joshua Jones v. Patrice Freeman, Cliff Testerman, Virginia Housing Development Authority and Rooftop of Virginia Community **Action Program**

At 12:56 P.M., Ms. Randall offered a motion which was seconded by Mr. Boynton, that the Board meeting be recessed and that the Fair Housing Board immediately reconvene in closed meeting for the purpose of consultation with legal counsel and briefings by staff members pertaining to actual or probable litigation as permitted by §2.2-3711.A.7 of the Code of Virginia. The following nonmembers will be in attendance to reasonably aid the consideration of the topic: Tom Payne, Deanda Shelton and Liz Hayes.

Closed Session

This motion is made with respect to the matter(s) identified as agenda item(s):

10. FHB File Number 2011-04838, Pamela Edwards and Joshua Jones v. Patrice Freeman, Cliff Testerman, Virginia Housing Development Authority and Rooftop of Virginia Community Action Program

At 1:25 P.M., a motion was made by Ms. Randall and seconded by Mr. Boynton that the Board reconvene in open session.

WHEREAS, the Fair Housing Board has convened a closed Certification

meeting on this date pursuant to an affirmative recorded vote in accordance with the provisions of the Virginia Freedom of Information Act; and

WHEREAS, §2.2-3712 of the *Code of Virginia* requires a certification by this Fair Housing Board that such closed meeting was conducted in conformity with Virginia law;

NOW, THEREFORE, BE IT RESOLVED that the Fair Housing Board hereby certifies that, to the best of each member's knowledge, (i) only public business matters lawfully exempted from open meeting requirements by Virginia law were discussed in the closed meeting to which this certification resolution applies and (ii) only such public business matters as were identified in the motion convening the closed meeting were heard, discussed or considered by the Fair Housing Board.

VOTE: 7-0

AYES: Adkins, Boynton, Gifford, Ginnell, Kim, Randall and Reisinger.

NAYS: None.

ABSENT DURING THE VOTE: None.

ABSENT DURING THE MEETING: Broady-Myers, Eck, Rubinstein, Stevens and Wilson.

In the matter of FHB File Number 2011-04838, Pamela Edwards and Joshua Jones v. Patrice Freeman, Cliff Testerman, Virginia Housing Development Authority and Rooftop of Virginia Community Action Program, a motion was made by Ms. Randall and seconded by Mr. Gifford to find no reasonable cause against Patrice Freeman, Cliff Testerman, and Rooftop of Virginia Community Action Program. The motion passed unanimously. Members voting "Yes" were: Adkins, Boynton, Gifford, Ginnell, Kim, Randall and Reisinger.

A motion was made by Mr. Boynton and seconded by Mr. Gifford to find reasonable cause the respondent, Virginia Housing Development Authority, discriminated against the complainant by refusing to make a reasonable

FHB File Number 2011-04838, Pamela Edwards and Joshua Jones v. Patrice Freeman, Cliff Testerman, Virginia Housing Development Authority and Rooftop of Virginia Community Action Program

accommodation based on disability. The motion passed unanimously. Members voting "Yes" were: Adkins, Boynton, Gifford, Ginnell, Kim, Randall and Reisinger.

The Board recessed from 1:30 P.M. to 1:37 P.M.

In the matter of FHB File Number 2012-02540, Ariel Azevedo v. Hope Hallaman, Jennifer Westerman, Capitol Asset Management, LLC, dba Legend Property Group, and 75 Commerce, LLC, the Board reviewed the record which consisted of the Final Investigative Report and Case Analysis and Recommendation. A motion was made by Mr. Gifford and seconded by Mr. Ginnell to close the case with a finding of no reasonable cause. The motion passed unanimously. Members voting "Yes" were: Adkins, Boynton, Gifford, Ginnell, Kim, Randall and Reisinger.

In the matter of FHB File Number 2012-02738, Alvin West v. Wavne Lambert and Tallseven Properties, LLC, the Board reviewed the record which consisted of the Final Investigative Report and Case Analysis Recommendation. A motion was made by Ms. Randall to refer the matter to the Office of the Attorney General for Consultation. There being no second, the motion failed. A motion was made by Mr. Gifford and seconded by Mr. Kim to close the case with a finding of no reasonable cause. The motion passed majority vote. Members voting "Yes" were: Adkins, Boynton, Gifford, Ginnell, Kim and Reisinger. Member voting "No" was Randall.

In the matter of FHB File Number 2012-03279, Crystal and Alex Madrid v. Autumn McQuay, King Properties, Inc., and RB Limited, LLC, the Board reviewed the record which consisted of the Final Investigative Report and Case Analysis and Recommendation. A motion was made by Mr. Ginnell and seconded by Mr. Gifford to close the case with a finding of no reasonable cause. The motion passed unanimously. Members voting "Yes" were: Adkins, Boynton, Gifford, Ginnell, Kim, Randall and Reisinger.

In the matter of FHB File Number 2012-02634, Mahesh Sikka and Sunaina Sikka v. River's Bend Community Association, Inc., a motion was made by Mr. Adkins and seconded by Mr. Boynton to approve the terms of the conciliation agreement as agreed to by the parties. The

Break

FHB File Number 2012-02540, Ariel Azevedo v. Hope Hallaman, Jennifer Westerman, Capitol Asset Management, LLC, dba Legend Property Group, and 75 Commerce, LLC

FHB File Number 2012-02738, Alvin West v. Wayne Lambert and Tallseven Properties, LLC

FHB File Number 2012-03279, Crystal and Alex Madrid v. Autumn McQuay, King Properties, Inc., and RB Limited, LLC

FHB File Number 2012-02634, Mahesh Sikka and Sunaina Sikka v. River's Bend Community Association, Inc.

motion passed unanimously. Members voting "Yes" were: Adkins, Boynton, Gifford, Ginnell, Kim, Randall and Reisinger.

In the matter of FHB File Number 2012-03067, Mark Hartley v. 1020 Tilden Street, LLC, a motion was made by Mr. Adkins and seconded by Mr. Boynton to approve the terms of the conciliation agreement as agreed to by the parties. The motion passed unanimously. Members voting "Yes" were: Adkins, Boynton, Gifford, Ginnell, Kim, Randall and Reisinger.

FHB File Number 2012-03067, Mark Hartley v. 1020 Tilden Street, LLC

In the matter of FHB File Number 2012-03337, Walter Tilghman v. Sherri McNamara, Property Manager; ICAFS, Inc. t/a General Services Corporation, Management Company; OBSA, L.L.C., Owner, a motion was made by Mr. Adkins and seconded by Mr. Boynton to approve the terms of the conciliation agreement as agreed to by the parties. The motion passed unanimously. Members voting "Yes" were: Adkins, Boynton, Gifford, Ginnell, Kim, Randall and Reisinger.

FHB File Number 2012-03337, Walter Tilghman v. Sherri McNamara, Property Manager; ICAFS, Inc. t/a General Services Corporation, Management Company; OBSA, L.L.C., Owner

In the matter of FHB File Number 2012-03646, Shirley Moran v. Tim Toller and Legacy Capital, LLC, a motion was made by Mr. Adkins and seconded by Mr. Boynton to approve the terms of the conciliation agreement as agreed to by the parties. The motion passed unanimously. Members voting "Yes" were: Adkins, Boynton, Gifford, Ginnell, Kim, Randall and Reisinger.

FHB File Number 2012-03646, Shirley Moran v. Tim Toller and Legacy Capital, LLC

In the matter of FHB File Number 2011-02837, Brian Tatum v. John Vandevander, a motion was made by Mr. Adkins and seconded by Mr. Boynton to approve the terms of the conciliation agreement as agreed to by the parties. The motion passed unanimously. Members voting "Yes" were: Adkins, Boynton, Gifford, Ginnell, Kim, Randall and Reisinger.

FHB File Number 2011-02837, Brian Tatum v. John Vandevander

At 2:00 P.M., Mr. Boynton offered a motion which was seconded by Mr. Reisinger, that the Board meeting be recessed and that the Fair Housing Board immediately reconvene in closed meeting for the purpose of consultation with legal counsel and briefings by staff members pertaining to actual or probable litigation as permitted by §2.2-3711.A.7 of the *Code of Virginia*. The following non-

Closed Session

members will be in attendance to reasonably aid the consideration of the topic: Tom Payne and Liz Hayes.

This motion is made with respect to the matter(s) identified as agenda item(s):

Old Business - Settlement Agreement - File No. 2009-04256 - Kathryn L. Sack v. Kathy Hughes, George and Stephen McClellan Trustees of Trust of Stephen A. McClellan Estate

At 2:05 P.M., a motion was made by Ms. Randall and seconded by Mr. Gifford that the Board reconvene in open session.

WHEREAS, the Fair Housing Board has convened a closed Certification meeting on this date pursuant to an affirmative recorded vote in accordance with the provisions of the Virginia Freedom of Information Act; and

WHEREAS, §2.2-3712 of the Code of Virginia requires a certification by this Fair Housing Board that such closed meeting was conducted in conformity with Virginia law;

NOW, THEREFORE, BE IT RESOLVED that the Fair Housing Board hereby certifies that, to the best of each member's knowledge, (i) only public business matters lawfully exempted from open meeting requirements by Virginia law were discussed in the closed meeting to which this certification resolution applies and (ii) only such public business matters as were identified in the motion convening the closed meeting were heard, discussed or considered by the Fair Housing Board.

VOTE: 7-0

AYES: Adkins, Boynton, Gifford, Ginnell, Kim, Randall and Reisinger.

NAYS: None.

ABSENT DURING THE VOTE: None.

ABSENT DURING THE MEETING: Broady-Myers, Eck, Rubinstein, Stevens and Wilson.

A motion was made by Ms. Randall and seconded by Mr. Old Business Reisinger to accept the settlement terms as presented in the matter of Kathryn L. Sack v. Kathy Hughes, George and Stephen McClellan Trustees of Trust of Stephen A. The motion passed unanimously. McClellan Estate. Members voting "Yes" were: Adkins, Boynton, Gifford, Ginnell, Kim, Randall and Reisinger.

The Board adjourned at 2:07 P.M.

1.	Name:Jim Ginnell
2.	Title: Board Member (Name of Board Member)
3.	Agency: Fair Housing Board (Name of Board)
4.	Meeting/IFF Date: September 27, 2012 (Date)
5.	I have a personal interest in the following transaction:
	(Agenda Item)
	Nature of Personal Interest Affected by Transaction:
	I declare that I am a member of the following business, profession, occupation or group, the members of which are affected by the transaction:
	 □ I am able to participate in this transaction fairly, objectively, and in the public interest. or
	☐ I did not participate in the transaction.
6.	I do not have a personal interest in any transactions taken at this meeting.
	Signature 9 27 12 Date

1.	Name: Thomas C. Gifford
2.	(Name of Board Member) Title: Board Member
3.	Agency: Fair Housing Board (Name of Board)
4.	Meeting/IFF Date: September 27, 2012 (Date)
5.	I have a personal interest in the following transaction:
	(Agenda Item)
	Nature of Personal Interest Affected by Transaction:
	I declare that I am a member of the following business, profession, occupation or group, the members of which are affected by the transaction:
	 I am able to participate in this transaction fairly, objectively, and in the public interest.
	☐ I did not participate in the transaction.
6.	do not have a personal interest in any transactions taken at this meeting.
	Soul Fifty 9/27/1-2
	Signature Date

1.	Name:Matthew K. Kim
2.	Title: Board Member (Name of Board Member)
3.	Agency: Fair Housing Board (Name of Board)
4.	Meeting/IFF Date: September 27, 2012 (Date)
5.	I have a personal interest in the following transaction:
	(Agenda Item)
	Nature of Personal Interest Affected by Transaction:
	I declare that I am a member of the following business, profession, occupation or group, the members of which are affected by the transaction:
	☐ I am able to participate in this transaction fairly, objectively, and in the public interest.
	or ☐ I did not participate in the transaction.
~	
6.	I do not have a personal interest in any transactions taken at this meeting.
	Signature Date

1.	Name: Jeffrey Adkins
2.	(Name of Board Member) Title: Board Member
3.	Agency: Fair Housing Board (Name of Board)
4.	Meeting/IFF Date: September 27, 2012 (Date)
5.	I have a personal interest in the following transaction:
	(Agenda Item)
	Nature of Personal Interest Affected by Transaction:
	I declare that I am a member of the following business, profession, occupation or group, the members of which are affected by the transaction:
	☐ I am able to participate in this transaction fairly, objectively, and in the public interest. or
	☐ I did not participate in the transaction.
3.	I do not have a personal interest in any transactions taken at this meeting.
	Signature Date

1.	Name: Bob Boynton
2.	(Name of Board Member) Title: Board Member
	Agency: Fair Housing Board (Name of Board)
4.	Meeting/IFF Date: September 27, 2012 (Date)
5.	I have a personal interest in the following transaction:
	N/A
	(Agenda Item)
	Nature of Personal Interest Affected by Transaction:
	I declare that I am a member of the following business, profession, occupation or group, the members of which are affected by the transaction:
	am able to participate in this transaction fairly, objectively, and in the public interest.
	☐ I did not participate in the transaction.
6.	do not have a personal interest in any transactions taken at this meeting.
	Signature Date 9/22/2012

1.	Name: Phyllis Randall
2.	Title: Board Member (Name of Board Member)
3.	Agency: Fair Housing Board (Name of Board)
4.	Meeting/IFF Date: September 27, 2012 (Date)
5.	I have a personal interest in the following transaction:
	(Agenda Item)
	Nature of Personal Interest Affected by Transaction:
	I declare that I am a member of the following business, profession, occupation or group, the members of which are affected by the transaction:
	 □ I am able to participate in this transaction fairly, objectively, and in the public interest. or
	☐ I did not participate in the transaction.
6.	I do not have a personal interest in any transactions taken at this meeting.
	Thyun Royall September 27, 2012 Signature Date

1.	Name: Andrew Reisinger
2.	Title: Board Member (Name of Board Member)
3.	Agency: Fair Housing Board (Name of Board)
4.	Meeting/IFF Date: September 27, 2012 (Date)
5.	I have a personal interest in the following transaction:
	(Agenda Item)
	Nature of Personal Interest Affected by Transaction:
	I declare that I am a member of the following business, profession, occupation or group, the members of which are affected by the transaction:
	☐ I am able to participate in this transaction fairly, objectively, and in the public interest. or
	☐ I did not participate in the transaction.
6.	I do not have a personal interest in any transactions taken at this meeting.
	Signature G-27-In Date